

THE STANDARD OF LIVING IN RIGHT TO WORK STATES

by

**Barry W. Poulson, Ph.D.
Professor of Economics
University of Colorado, Boulder**

January 2005

prepared for and distributed by



NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR LABOR RELATIONS RESEARCH

5211 Port Royal Road, Suite 510 • Springfield, Virginia 22151 • 703-321-9606 • www.nilrr.org • research@nilrr.org

Introduction

Twenty-two states now have Right to Work laws. In these states employees do not have to financially support a union with monopoly bargaining privileges at their work place in order to keep their jobs. In states that do not have Right to Work laws, an employee of a unionized firm must financially support the union in order to get or keep his or her job. Individual employees in these states are coerced into paying union dues, regardless of whether they desire union representation. Union officials often defend this coercion on the grounds that employees are better off in states without Right to Work laws. They point to evidence that money incomes are higher in the 28 forced-unionism states.

But to answer the question of whether employees are better off in forced-unionism states, we must look beyond money income. Just as money income varies across regions, so do other factors that influence individual well being. Other tangible factors vary across regions, such as cost of living and the burden of taxation. To ascertain whether employees are really better off in forced-unionism states, we must compare money income after adjusting for cost of living and taxes. It is this adjusted income measure that captures the real purchasing power of employees' disposable income in the different states. Intangible factors that influence individual well being, such as freedom from coercion, also vary across regions. In the present study, we approach this issue utilizing a new data base and a different methodology than that utilized in previous studies.

A Literature Review

Two early studies addressing this issue compared after-tax real income in Right to Work states with that in forced-unionism states.ⁱ These studies found that money income was higher in forced-unionism states. However, once money income was adjusted for the cost of living and taxes, after-tax real income was higher in Right to Work states.

One of the criticisms of these early studies is that a cost of living index is more difficult to determine for an entire state than for individual cities. For example, my own state of Colorado includes some cities with an extraordinarily high cost of living, e.g. Boulder; and many communities with a very low cost of living, e.g. communities in the San Luis Valley. Lumping such disparate communities together under a single cost of living index may bias the analysis.

A more recent study by James T. Bennett addressed this criticism by using data at the city level.ⁱⁱ The rationale is that cities across the country are likely to be more homogeneous than different communities within a state. Therefore, cost of living indexes calculated for individual cities are likely to be more comparable.

Bennett calculated adjusted household income, utilizing the data from *Places Rated Almanac*, by David Savageau and Ralph D'Agostino.ⁱⁱⁱ *Places Rated Almanac* provides data for household income and cost of living indexes incorporating state and local taxes for 329 Standard Metropolitan Areas (SMSAs). Bennett found that, on average, it cost 15 percent more to live in an SMSA in a forced-unionism state than it did in a Right to Work state. The adjusted income for two-income households in SMSAs in Right to Work states averaged \$64,070, compared to \$62,085 in forced-unionism states, a difference of \$1985.

Estimating the Standard of Living in Right to Work States and Forced-Unionism States

Clearly, it is crucial to use adjusted income, taking into account differences in cost of living and taxes, in comparing standards of living in Right to Work states and forced-unionism states. This study utilizes an approach similar to that in the Bennett study, comparing adjusted household income in SMSAs. However, the current study relies on a different data base, and introduces some refinements in methodology.

It is not possible to replicate earlier studies of this issue, such as the Bennett study, because of a lack of data. The U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics no longer publishes the data series used in the early studies noted above. The last *Places Rated Almanac* was published in 2000, and there are no plans to publish an updated edition.

However, a new publication does provide the data necessary to calculate adjusted household incomes: *Cities Ranked and Rated*, by Bert Sperling and Peter Sanders.^{iv} In that publication, the cost of living indexes take into account the cost of food, health care, transportation, recreation, utilities, property taxes, housing prices and rents, and state and local income taxes, property taxes, and sales taxes.

SMSAs in Right to Work States and in Forced-Unionism States

The SMSAs in the present study differ from those in the Bennett study for several reasons. There are four SMSAs in the present study that were not included in the Bennett study. Of these four SMSAs, two are in Right to Work states (Auburn-Obelika and Shreveport), and two are in forced-unionism states (Corvallis and Nassau-Suffolk). Since the Bennett study was published, one state, Oklahoma, has enacted a Right to Work law. Therefore, four Oklahoma SMSAs (Enid, Lawton, Oklahoma City and Tulsa) that were labeled as forced-unionism SMSAs in the Bennett study are included among the Right to Work SMSAs in the present study.

In the Bennett study, seven SMSAs were omitted from the analysis because part of the SMSA lies within a Right to Work state, and part lies within a forced-unionism state. Six of these SMSAs are omitted from the present study for the same reason: Clarksville-Hopkinsville, Davenport-Moline-Rock Island, Fargo-Moorehead, Grand Forks, Kansas City, and Washington, D.C. However, one of these SMSAs, Fort Smith, which lies in

Oklahoma and Arkansas, is included in the present study because both of these states are now Right to Work states.

Cost of Living

The Sperling/Sanders data for cost of living is divided into three different attributes: Indexes and Taxes, Housing, and Necessities. The following table illustrates the cost of living for San Luis Obispo-Atascadero-Paso Robles, California. The cost of living index is a composite of all attributes expressed as an index against the national average of 100.

Table 1. Sample Cost of Living Table from San Luis Obispo-Atascadero-Paso Robles, California

COST OF LIVING SCORE: 5
RANK: 312

INDEXES AND TAXES	AREA	U.S. AVERAGE
Cost of Living Index	155.1	100.0
Financial Progress Index	66.5	100.0
Income Tax Rate	6.00%	4.625%
Sales Tax Rate	7.250%	6.474%
Property Tax Rate	\$11.1	\$15.6
HOUSING	AREA	U.S. AVERAGE
Median Home Price	\$380,130	\$160,100
Home Price Appreciation	18.2%	7.1%
Median Rent	\$917	\$670
Homes Owned	52.9%	63.9%
Homes Rented	33.3%	25.3%
Housing Affordability	42.0%	54.5%
NECESSITIES	AREA	U.S. AVERAGE
Food Index	112.4	100.0
Housing Index	236.1	100.0
Utilities Index	116.6	100.0
Transportation Index	111.5	100.0
Healthcare Index	112.0	100.0
Miscellaneous Cost Index	103.2	100.0

Source: Bert Sperling and Peter Sander, *Cities Ranked and Rated*, Wiley Publishing, Inc., Hoboken, N.J., 2004, p.71.

Adjusted Household Income

In the following tables, the adjusted household income is calculated for Right to Work states and forced-unionism states. Table 2 lists alphabetically the 133 SMSAs in the Right to Work states and their related data. Table 3 lists the 158 SMSAs in forced-unionism states and their related data. For each SMSA, the following data are listed: typical household income (unadjusted income), the cost of living index (which includes state and local taxes), and adjusted household income. (Household incomes for both Right to Work and forced-unionism states in the following tables are significantly lower than in the Bennett study because the data furnished in *Cities Ranked and Rated* cover all households, and not just two-income households, as was the case with the Bennett study.)

Table 2. Adjusted Household Income in SMSAs in Right to Work States

Metropolitan Area	State	Household Income	Cost of Living Index	Adjusted Household Income
Abilene	TX	\$37,944	75.7	\$50,124
Albany	GA	\$39,954	81.9	\$48,784
Alexandria	LA	\$33,022	80.4	\$41,072
Amarillo	TX	\$40,876	80.3	\$50,904
Anniston	AL	\$32,190	79.1	\$40,695
Asheville	NC	\$40,773	94.8	\$43,009
Athens	GA	\$37,878	95.4	\$39,704
Atlanta	GA	\$59,423	96.6	\$61,514
Auburn-Opelika	AL	\$30,615	89.2	\$34,322
Augusta-Aiken	GA-SC	\$40,794	84.7	\$48,163
Austin-San Marcos	TX	\$60,068	95.3	\$63,030
Baton Rouge	LA	\$42,753	95.0	\$45,003
Beaumont-Port Arthur	TX	\$38,803	80.0	\$48,504
Birmingham	AL	\$45,047	94.0	\$47,922
Bismarck	ND	\$43,662	88.8	\$49,169
Boise	ID	\$46,322	91.5	\$50,625
Brownsville-Harlingen-San Benito	TX	\$27,679	76.2	\$36,324
Casper	WY	\$45,555	86.7	\$52,543
Cedar Rapids	IA	\$54,695	91.6	\$59,711
Charleston-North Charleston	SC	\$42,473	100.0	\$42,473
Charlotte-Gastonia-Rock Hill	NC-SC	\$51,559	95.7	\$53,876
Charlottesville	VA	\$50,130	102.5	\$48,907
Chattanooga	TN-GA	\$41,671	87.1	\$47,843
Cheyenne	WY	\$45,478	92.5	\$49,165
Columbia	SC	\$48,503	89.5	\$54,193
Columbus	GA-AL	\$37,565	83.2	\$45,150
Corpus Christi	TX	\$39,789	80.3	\$49,550
Dallas	TX	\$59,153	95.0	\$62,266
Danville	VA	\$31,305	78.0	\$40,135
Daytona Beach	FL	\$35,521	86.5	\$41,065
Decatur	AL	\$40,227	82.1	\$48,998
Des Moines	IA	\$55,547	94.2	\$58,967
Dothan	AL	\$35,089	80.6	\$43,535
Dubuque	IA	\$44,603	88.8	\$50,229
Duluth-Superior	MN-WI	\$39,939	91.5	\$43,649
El Paso	TX	\$31,932	83.1	\$38,426
Enid	OK	\$34,287	76.8	\$44,645
Fayetteville	NC	\$42,175	87.4	\$48,255
Fayetteville-Springdale-Rogers	AR	\$40,370	82.0	\$49,232
Flagstaff	AZ-UT	\$40,572	102.9	\$39,429

Florence	AL	\$32,788	79.1	\$41,451
Florence	SC	\$39,026	84.0	\$46,460
Fort Lauderdale	FL	\$44,247	113.9	\$38,847
Fort Smith	AR-OK	\$37,488	76.4	\$49,068
Fort Walton Beach	FL	\$41,400	88.6	\$46,727
Fort Worth-Arlington	TX	\$55,157	85.9	\$64,211
Gadsden	AL	\$31,460	77.8	\$40,437
Gainesville	FL	\$34,900	91.1	\$38,310
Goldsboro	NC	\$35,942	81.8	\$43,939
Greensboro-Winston-Salem-High Point	NC	\$46,430	91.6	\$50,688
Greenville	NC	\$34,395	87.0	\$39,534
Greenville-Spartanburg-Anderson	SC	\$42,630	89.4	\$47,685
Hattiesburg	MS	\$32,581	80.9	\$40,273
Hickory-Morganton-Lenoir	NC	\$41,734	85.9	\$48,584
Houma	LA	\$37,128	88.3	\$42,048
Houston	TX	\$55,692	91.8	\$60,667
Huntsville	AL	\$49,596	87.1	\$56,941
Iowa City	IA	\$48,432	97.7	\$49,572
Jackson	MS	\$46,856	79.1	\$59,236
Jackson	TN	\$42,715	83.3	\$51,279
Jacksonville	FL	\$45,338	89.0	\$50,942
Jacksonville	NC	\$43,448	83.2	\$52,221
Johnson City-Kingsport-Bristol	TN-VA	\$32,897	79.9	\$41,173
Jonesboro	AR	\$36,436	77.5	\$47,014
Killeen-Temple	TX	\$38,754	80.5	\$48,142
Knoxville	TN	\$40,072	87.2	\$45,954
Lafayette	LA	\$32,755	81.4	\$40,240
Lake Charles	LA	\$40,197	80.6	\$49,872
Lakeland-Winter Haven	FL	\$35,584	87.9	\$40,482
Laredo	TX	\$29,892	77.3	\$38,670
Las Vegas	NV-AZ	\$48,723	103.1	\$47,258
Lawrence	KS	\$39,088	95.6	\$40,887
Lawton	OK	\$37,990	81.2	\$46,786
Lincoln	NE	\$50,530	93.9	\$53,813
Little Rock-North Little Rock	AR	\$45,421	83.4	\$54,462
Longview-Marshall	TX	\$36,536	76.0	\$48,074
Lubbock	TX	\$37,470	80.2	\$46,721
Lynchburg	VA	\$38,368	85.3	\$44,980
Macon	GA	\$42,106	85.9	\$49,017
McAllen-Edinburg-Mission	TX	\$25,726	74.2	\$34,671
Memphis	TN-AR-MS	\$46,253	89.2	\$51,853
Miami	FL	\$39,604	108.8	\$36,401
Mobile	AL	\$37,313	87.3	\$42,741
Monroe	LA	\$35,118	85.6	\$41,026
Montgomery	AL	\$41,426	84.8	\$48,851
Myrtle Beach	SC	\$42,302	94.9	\$44,575
Naples	FL	\$57,326	123.0	\$46,607
Nashville	TN	\$51,379	92.3	\$55,665
New Orleans	LA	\$40,672	94.0	\$43,268
Ocala	FL	\$31,547	86.1	\$36,640
Odessa-Midland	TX	\$39,029	76.2	\$51,219
Oklahoma City	OK	\$40,347	84.3	\$47,861
Omaha	NE-IA	\$52,174	92.2	\$56,588
Orlando	FL	\$45,146	95.6	\$47,224
Panama City	FL	\$36,595	88.7	\$41,257
Pensacola	FL	\$36,969	88.0	\$42,010
Phoenix-Mesa	AZ	\$49,779	98.7	\$50,435
Pine Bluff	AR	\$33,714	79.1	\$42,622
Pocatello	ID	\$39,862	85.1	\$46,841
Provo-Orem	UT	\$51,599	101.8	\$50,687
Punta Gorda	FL	\$32,633	95.2	\$34,278
Raleigh-Durham-Chapel Hill	NC	\$56,436	103.6	\$54,475
Rapid City	SD	\$40,540	90.0	\$45,044
Reno	NV	\$54,011	111.2	\$48,571

Richmond-Petersburg	VA	\$52,306	94.1	\$55,586
Roanoke	VA	\$45,151	84.7	\$53,307
Rocky Mount	NC	\$32,401	85.3	\$37,985
Salt Lake City-Ogden	UT	\$56,636	97.3	\$58,208
San Angelo	TX	\$36,982	77.3	\$47,842
San Antonio	TX	\$43,228	82.8	\$52,208
Sarasota-Bradenton	FL	\$42,449	100.0	\$42,449
Savannah	GA	\$41,802	91.0	\$45,936
Sherman-Denison	TX	\$39,443	81.6	\$48,337
Shreveport-Bossier City	LA	\$38,129	78.5	\$48,572
Sioux City	IA-NE	\$42,492	84.5	\$50,286
Sioux Falls	SD	\$52,728	92.6	\$56,942
Sumter	SC	\$34,456	82.4	\$41,816
Tallahassee	FL	\$41,207	99.5	\$41,414
Tampa-St. Petersburg-Clearwater	FL	\$41,625	92.6	\$44,951
Texarkana	TX-AR	\$35,017	73.4	\$47,707
Topeka	KS	\$43,972	82.7	\$53,170
Tucson	AZ	\$40,683	98.0	\$41,513
Tulsa	OK	\$44,811	86.8	\$51,626
Tuscaloosa	AL	\$36,407	90.9	\$40,052
Tyler	TX	\$43,361	80.8	\$53,665
Victoria	TX	\$43,566	75.5	\$57,703
Waco	TX	\$39,295	78.3	\$50,185
Waterloo-Cedar Falls	IA	\$41,213	83.2	\$49,535
West Palm Beach-Boca Raton	FL	\$51,876	111.2	\$46,651
Wichita	KS	\$47,797	85.8	\$55,707
Wichita Falls	TX	\$36,732	76.9	\$47,766
Wilmington	NC	\$40,224	97.6	\$41,213
Yuma	AZ	\$31,911	88.5	\$36,058
SUM		\$5,543,543	11710.4	\$6,293,575
AVERAGE		\$41,681	88.0	\$47,320

Table 3. Adjusted Household Income in SMSAs in Forced-Unionism States

Metropolitan Area	State	Household Income	Cost of Living Index	Adjusted Household Income
Akron	OH	\$46,466	93.8	\$49,537
Albany-Schenectady-Troy	NY	\$48,861	110.0	\$44,419
Albuquerque	NM	\$45,403	94.6	\$47,995
Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton	PA	\$48,157	99.2	\$48,545
Altoona	PA	\$37,387	81.4	\$45,930
Anchorage	AK	\$70,833	118.5	\$59,775
Ann Arbor	MI	\$62,119	110.3	\$56,318
Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenah	WI	\$52,817	89.1	\$59,278
Atlantic City-Cape May	NJ	\$45,694	103.1	\$44,320
Bakersfield	CA	\$36,457	95.0	\$38,376
Baltimore	MD	\$55,897	106.9	\$52,289
Bangor	ME	\$36,147	94.4	\$38,291
Barnstable-Yarmouth	MA	\$50,114	141.7	\$35,366
Bellingham	WA	\$41,931	106.6	\$39,335
Billings	MT	\$41,554	90.3	\$46,018
Binghamton	NY	\$38,750	84.7	\$45,750
Bloomington	IN	\$39,395	94.9	\$41,512
Bloomington-Normal	IL	\$54,304	94.4	\$57,525
Boston	MA-NH	\$63,784	162.9	\$39,155
Boulder-Longmont	CO	\$66,602	140.8	\$47,303
Bremerton	WA	\$47,689	108.1	\$44,116
Bridgeport	CT	\$79,096	136.8	\$57,819
Buffalo-Niagara Falls	NY	\$43,785	87.6	\$49,983
Burlington	VT	\$52,027	109.2	\$47,644
Canton-Massillon	OH	\$41,834	90.9	\$46,022
Champaign-Urbana	IL	\$40,856	92.1	\$44,360
Charleston	WV	\$38,723	84.9	\$45,610

Chicago	IL	\$63,096	119.8	\$52,668
Chico-Paradise	CA	\$34,282	116.1	\$29,528
Cincinnati - Covington	OH-KY- IN	\$50,023	93.0	\$53,788
Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria	OH	\$46,630	99.6	\$46,817
Colorado Springs	CO	\$52,276	103.1	\$50,704
Columbia	MO	\$44,112	89.5	\$49,287
Columbus	OH	\$50,334	95.8	\$52,541
Corvallis	OR	\$48,602	109.0	\$44,589
Cumberland	MD-WV	\$31,176	79.0	\$39,463
Dayton-Springfield	OH	\$45,798	87.7	\$52,221
Decatur	IL	\$44,896	77.4	\$58,005
Denver	CO	\$62,986	118.9	\$52,974
Detroit	MI	\$55,418	101.5	\$54,599
Dover	DE	\$41,631	96.0	\$43,366
Eau Claire	WI	\$43,031	92.1	\$46,722
Elkhart-Goshen	IN	\$49,970	87.3	\$57,239
Elmira	NY	\$38,514	81.8	\$47,083
Erie	PA	\$40,948	85.9	\$47,669
Eugene-Springfield	OR	\$39,250	99.0	\$39,646
Evansville-Henderson	IN-KY	\$43,944	81.1	\$54,185
Flint	MI	\$48,069	88.5	\$54,315
Fort Collins-Loveland	CO	\$52,465	116.3	\$45,112
Fort Wayne	IN	\$48,099	83.6	\$57,535
Fresno	CA	\$35,635	103.6	\$34,397
Gary	IN	\$47,700	97.6	\$48,873
Glens Falls	NY	\$39,879	95.6	\$41,714
Grand Junction	CO	\$39,565	99.3	\$39,844
Grand Rapids-Muskegon-Holland	MI	\$53,279	93.5	\$56,983
Great Falls	MT	\$36,389	86.3	\$42,166
Greeley	CO	\$42,835	106.2	\$40,334
Green Bay	WI	\$52,905	93.7	\$56,462
Hagerstown	MD	\$42,490	91.5	\$46,437
Harrisburg-Lebanon-Carlisle	PA	\$48,289	91.1	\$53,007
Hartford	CT	\$59,970	113.1	\$53,024
Honolulu	HI	\$60,112	152.7	\$39,366
Huntington-Ashland	WV-KY- OH	\$29,981	81.2	\$36,922
Indianapolis	IN	\$52,554	87.3	\$60,199
Jackson	MI	\$44,494	89.7	\$49,603
Jamestown	NY	\$33,311	84.6	\$39,375
Janesville-Beloit	WI	\$46,791	91.5	\$51,138
Johnstown	PA	\$30,250	79.7	\$37,955
Joplin	MO	\$36,904	74.2	\$49,736
Kalamazoo-Battle Creek	MI	\$42,578	88.5	\$48,111
Kankakee	IL	\$43,233	93.7	\$46,140
Kenosha	WI	\$49,238	98.0	\$50,243
Kokomo	IN	\$47,020	83.2	\$56,514
La Crosse	WI-MN	\$42,400	91.7	\$46,238
Lafayette	IN	\$43,472	86.3	\$50,373
Lancaster	PA	\$50,626	94.6	\$53,516
Lansing-East Lansing	MI	\$48,810	90.2	\$54,113
Las Cruces	NM	\$30,819	84.9	\$36,300
Lewiston-Auburn	ME	\$36,956	95.2	\$38,819
Lexington	KY	\$44,066	92.1	\$47,846
Lima	OH	\$40,804	86.3	\$47,282
Los Angeles-Long Beach	CA	\$50,203	139.3	\$36,039
Louisville	KY-IN	\$46,230	89.5	\$51,654
Madison	WI	\$54,655	105.3	\$51,904
Manchester	NH	\$59,976	115.5	\$51,927
Mansfield	OH	\$36,080	87.3	\$41,329
Medford-Ashland	OR	\$38,067	106.0	\$35,912
Merced	CA	\$31,368	111.7	\$28,082
Milwaukee-Waukesha	WI	\$53,304	106.8	\$49,910
Minneapolis-St. Paul	MN-WI	\$65,330	114.7	\$56,957

Missoula	MT	\$40,912	104.1	\$39,301
Modesto	CA	\$43,640	116.7	\$37,395
Muncie	IN	\$37,248	80.5	\$46,271
New Haven-Meriden	CT	\$68,472	116.9	\$58,573
New York	NY	\$52,380	161.0	\$32,534
Newark	NJ	\$68,961	140.5	\$49,083
Oakland	CA	\$71,689	179.3	\$39,983
Olympia	WA	\$46,826	104.5	\$44,810
Owensboro	KY	\$37,214	81.4	\$45,717
Parkersburg-Marietta	WV-OH	\$36,670	86.8	\$42,247
Peoria-Pekin	IL	\$46,992	83.9	\$56,010
Philadelphia	PA-NJ	\$55,192	105.2	\$52,464
Pittsburgh	PA	\$41,809	90.0	\$46,454
Pittsfield	MA	\$41,865	108.6	\$38,550
Portland	ME	\$52,418	112.4	\$46,635
Portland-Vancouver	OR-WA	\$54,290	109.7	\$49,490
Providence-Fall River-Warwick	RI-MA	\$47,646	118.4	\$40,242
Pueblo	CO	\$34,723	87.7	\$39,593
Racine	WI	\$52,627	95.6	\$55,049
Reading	PA	\$47,777	93.8	\$50,935
Redding	CA	\$33,940	105.3	\$32,232
Riverside-San Bernardino	CA	\$45,837	112.6	\$40,708
Rochester	MN-WI	\$62,051	102.7	\$60,420
Rochester	NY	\$49,179	90.5	\$54,341
Rockford	IL	\$48,069	91.4	\$52,592
Sacramento	CA	\$51,893	123.4	\$42,053
Saginaw-Bay City-Midland	MI	\$43,890	84.8	\$51,757
Salem	OR	\$45,688	100.4	\$45,506
Salinas	CA	\$59,292	169.5	\$34,981
San Diego	CA	\$54,972	157.7	\$34,859
San Francisco	CA	\$76,164	196.4	\$38,780
San Jose	CA	\$93,503	184.1	\$50,789
San Luis Obispo-Atascadero-Paso Robles	CA	\$48,421	155.1	\$31,219
Santa Cruz-Watsonville	CA	\$69,148	177.6	\$38,935
Santa Fe	NM	\$52,824	118.6	\$44,540
Santa Rosa	CA	\$61,423	177.3	\$34,644
SantaBarbara-Santa Maria-Lompoc	CA	\$51,277	173.6	\$29,537
Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton	PA	\$34,708	86.4	\$40,171
Seattle-Bellevue-Everett	WA	\$69,730	123.0	\$56,691
Sheboygan	WI	\$50,326	91.0	\$55,303
South Bend	IN	\$43,880	82.4	\$53,252
Spokane	WA	\$42,105	89.4	\$47,097
Springfield	IL	\$45,936	81.6	\$56,294
Springfield	MA	\$43,948	104.5	\$42,056
Springfield	MO	\$40,086	83.1	\$48,238
St. Cloud	MN	\$43,220	98.2	\$44,012
St. Joseph	MO	\$37,598	81.3	\$46,246
St. Louis	MO-IL	\$51,803	89.0	\$58,206
State College	PA	\$38,383	92.5	\$41,495
Stockton-Lodi	CA	\$44,975	122.8	\$36,625
Syracuse	NY	\$44,748	88.4	\$50,620
Tacoma	WA	\$52,137	105.5	\$49,419
Terre Haute	IN	\$36,209	82.9	\$43,678
Toledo	OH	\$43,082	91.0	\$47,343
Trenton	NJ	\$69,514	113.0	\$61,517
Utica-Rome	NY	\$36,763	89.4	\$41,122
Vallejo-Fairfield-Napa	CA	\$63,508	149.1	\$42,594
Vineland-Millville-Bridgeton	NJ	\$40,867	91.9	\$44,469
Visalia-Tulare-Porterville	CA	\$36,518	94.1	\$38,808
Wausau	WI	\$49,498	89.8	\$55,120
Wheeling	WV-OH	\$32,899	84.8	\$38,796
Williamsport	PA	\$35,909	82.9	\$43,316
Wilmington-Newark	DE-MD	\$61,464	102.4	\$60,023
Worcester	MA-CT	\$54,294	114.3	\$47,501

Yakima	WA	\$37,597	92.8	\$40,514
York	PA	\$47,924	91.3	\$52,491
Youngstown-Warren	OH	\$36,916	82.9	\$44,531
Yuba City-Marysville	CA	\$34,857	109.4	\$31,862
SUM		\$7,519,124	16376.5	\$7,348,029
AVERAGE		\$47,589	103.6	\$46,507

The average cost of living index for SMSAs in Right to Work states is 88, while that for SMSAs in forced-unionism states is 103.6. Thus, on average, it costs families almost 18 percent more to live in an SMSA in a forced-unionism state than it does to live in an SMSA in a Right to Work state. This differential means that each dollar goes much further for families in Right to Work states, and this is captured in our measure of adjusted household income.

The data for typical household income unadjusted for cost of living are consistent with the argument made by union advocates. The average household income in SMSAs with Right to Work laws is \$41,681. The average household income in forced-unionism SMSAs is \$47,589. The \$5908 differential in typical household income supports the Organized Labor argument that families are better off living in states without Right to Work laws. However, this argument is not supported when we take into account cost of living to determine adjusted household income.

The average cost of living-adjusted household income in SMSAs in Right to Work states is \$47,320. Average adjusted household income in SMSAs in forced-unionism states is \$46,507. In terms of what their money income can buy, families living in SMSAs in Right to Work states are \$813 better off than families living in SMSAs in forced-unionism states. This evidence refutes Organized Labor's argument that families are better off living in states without Right to Work laws.

Weighted Adjusted Household Income

An important refinement in the present study is to calculate a weighted adjusted household income. In the following tables, income in each SMSA is weighted for the number of households living in each SMSA. The number of households in each SMSA comes from census data provided on a CD ROM entitled *2004 MSA Profile* from Woods and Poole Economics in Washington, D.C.

Several adjustments were required to make the census data for the numbers of households comparable to the data from *Cities Ranked and Rated*. Data for number of households are not available for 34 of the SMSAs included in the *Cities Ranked and Rated* data set. Generally, these are smaller SMSAs, so their exclusion is not likely to bias the results. The definition of SMSAs in the *2004 MSA Profile* does not always correspond exactly to the definition of SMSAs in *Cities Ranked and Rated*. Other census data were then used to provide a better match-up to these SMSAs.

Table 4. Weighted Adjusted Household Income in SMSAs in Right to Work States

Metropolitan Area	State	Total Households	Household Income	Cost of Living Index	Adjusted Household Income	Weighted Adjusted Household Income
Abilene	TX	58.244	\$37,944	75.7	\$50,124	2919432.412
Albany	GA	58.396	\$39,954	81.9	\$48,784	2848783.619
Alexandria	LA	54.890	\$33,022	80.4	\$41,072	2254449.726
Amarillo	TX	87.558	\$40,876	80.3	\$50,904	4457062.027
Anniston	AL	45.463	\$32,190	79.1	\$40,695	1850131.441
Asheville	NC	159.332	\$40,773	94.8	\$43,009	6852788.646
Athens	GA	65.753	\$37,878	95.4	\$39,704	2610683.579
Atlanta	GA	1662.995	\$59,423	96.6	\$61,514	102298293.9
Auburn-Opelika	AL	47.304	\$30,615	89.2	\$34,322	1623556.009
Augusta-Aiken	GA-SC	188.689	\$40,794	84.7	\$48,163	9087814.718
Austin-San Marcos	TX	511.992	\$60,068	95.3	\$63,030	32271076.03
Baton Rouge	LA	262.632	\$42,753	95.0	\$45,003	11819269.36
Beaumont-Port Arthur	TX	142.020	\$38,803	80.0	\$48,504	6888502.575
Birmingham	AL	421.585	\$45,047	94.0	\$47,922	20203339.89
Bismarck	ND	38.583	\$43,662	88.8	\$49,169	1897084.399
Boise	ID	183.684	\$46,322	91.5	\$50,625	9299027.593
Brownsville-Harlingen-San Benito	TX	103.330	\$27,679	76.2	\$36,324	3753374.108
Casper	WY	27.277	\$45,555	86.7	\$52,543	1433222.301
Cedar Rapids	IA	96.446	\$54,695	91.6	\$59,711	5758858.046
Charleston-North Charleston	SC	214.851	\$42,473	100.0	\$42,473	9125366.523
Charlotte-Gastonia-Rock Hill	NC-SC	544.612	\$51,559	95.7	\$53,876	29341327.18
Charlottesville	VA	70.067	\$50,130	102.5	\$48,907	3426788.985
Chattanooga	TN-GA	193.336	\$41,671	87.1	\$47,843	9249718.09
Cheyenne	WY	32.572	\$45,478	92.5	\$49,165	1601415.585
Columbia	SC	253.768	\$48,503	89.5	\$54,193	13752524.36
Columbus	GA-AL	104.983	\$37,565	83.2	\$45,150	4740007.686
Corpus Christi	TX	143.242	\$39,789	80.3	\$49,550	7097703.534
Dallas	TX	1343.418	\$59,153	95.0	\$62,266	83649689.43
Danville	VA	45.243	\$31,305	78.0	\$40,135	1815810.404
Daytona Beach	FL	192.807	\$35,521	86.5	\$41,065	7917569.303
Decatur	AL	57.831	\$40,227	82.1	\$48,998	2833578.121
Des Moines	IA	196.918	\$55,547	94.2	\$58,967	11611681.68
Dothan	AL	53.610	\$35,089	80.6	\$43,535	2333897.382
Dubuque	IA	34.032	\$44,603	88.8	\$50,229	1709379.838
Duluth-Superior	MN-WI	113.443	\$39,939	91.5	\$43,649	4951693.964
El Paso	TX	216.893	\$31,932	83.1	\$38,426	8334328.852
Enid	OK	23.086	\$34,287	76.8	\$44,645	1030663.648
Fayetteville	NC	120.844	\$42,175	87.4	\$48,255	5831345.195
Fayetteville-Springdale-Rogers	AR	140.829	\$40,370	82.0	\$49,232	6933252.11
Flagstaff	AZ-UT	42.218	\$40,572	102.9	\$39,429	1664595.429
Florence	AL	58.640	\$32,788	79.1	\$41,451	2430705.841
Florence	SC	74.191	\$39,026	84.0	\$46,460	3446878.531
Fort Lauderdale	FL	691.935	\$44,247	113.9	\$38,847	26879761.15
Fort Smith	AR-OK	107.306	\$37,488	76.4	\$49,068	5265297.55
Fort Walton Beach	FL	69.008	\$41,400	88.6	\$46,727	3224527.314
Fort Worth-Arlington	TX	666.601	\$55,157	85.9	\$64,211	42802923.58
Gadsden	AL	41.760	\$31,460	77.8	\$40,437	1688649.871
Gainesville	FL	94.988	\$34,900	91.1	\$38,310	3638947.53
Goldsboro	NC	42.876	\$35,942	81.8	\$43,939	1883923.218
Greensboro-Winston-Salem-High Point	NC	528.874	\$46,430	91.6	\$50,688	26807445.22
Greenville	NC	61.306	\$34,395	87.0	\$39,534	2423701
Greenville-Spartanburg-Anderson	SC	320.656	\$42,630	89.4	\$47,685	15290341.48
Hattiesburg	MS	47.403	\$32,581	80.9	\$40,273	1909069.398
Hickory-Morganton-Lenoir	NC	137.750	\$41,734	85.9	\$48,584	6692501.164
Houma	LA	69.435	\$37,128	88.3	\$42,048	2919572.684

Houston	TX	1760.874	\$55,692	91.8	\$60,667	106826356
Huntsville	AL	140.261	\$49,596	87.1	\$56,941	7986664.243
Iowa City	IA	54.122	\$48,432	97.7	\$49,572	2682944.426
Jackson	MS	184.628	\$46,856	79.1	\$59,236	10936699.83
Jackson	TN	42.249	\$42,715	83.3	\$51,279	2166465.828
Jacksonville	FL	457.030	\$45,338	89.0	\$50,942	23281827.12
Jacksonville	NC	48.613	\$43,448	83.2	\$52,221	2538626.952
Johnson City-Kingsport-Bristol	TN-VA	201.918	\$32,897	79.9	\$41,173	8313512.448
Jonesboro	AR	43.332	\$36,436	77.5	\$47,014	2037219.035
Killeen-Temple	TX	115.609	\$38,754	80.5	\$48,142	5565603.958
Knoxville	TN	260.831	\$40,072	87.2	\$45,954	11986261.28
Lafayette	LA	91.491	\$32,755	81.4	\$40,240	3681557.377
Lake Charles	LA	72.460	\$40,197	80.6	\$49,872	3613740.223
Lakeland-Winter Haven	FL	194.227	\$35,584	87.9	\$40,482	7862768.564
Laredo	TX	54.906	\$29,892	77.3	\$38,670	2123221.413
Las Vegas	NV-AZ	569.926	\$48,723	103.1	\$47,258	26933564.01
Lawrence	KS	39.841	\$39,088	95.6	\$40,887	1628980.134
Lawton	OK	39.528	\$37,990	81.2	\$46,786	1849345.714
Lincoln	NE	109.119	\$50,530	93.9	\$53,813	5871973.45
Little Rock-North Little Rock	AR	247.781	\$45,421	83.4	\$54,462	13494557.32
Longview-Marshall	TX	98.439	\$36,536	76.0	\$48,074	4732325.4
Lubbock	TX	97.414	\$37,470	80.2	\$46,721	4551250.1
Lynchburg	VA	90.800	\$38,368	85.3	\$44,980	4084190.387
Macon	GA	85.819	\$42,106	85.9	\$49,017	4206629.586
McAllen-Edinburg-Mission	TX	170.340	\$25,726	74.2	\$34,671	5905885.229
Memphis	TN-AR-MS	461.195	\$46,253	89.2	\$51,853	23914408.45
Miami	FL	806.377	\$39,604	108.8	\$36,401	29352715.72
Mobile	AL	151.333	\$37,313	87.3	\$42,741	6468142.301
Monroe	LA	64.582	\$35,118	85.6	\$41,026	2649521.818
Montgomery	AL	132.254	\$41,426	84.8	\$48,851	6460795.052
Myrtle Beach	SC	86.322	\$42,302	94.9	\$44,575	3847832.712
Naples	FL	114.031	\$57,326	123.0	\$46,607	5314586.265
Nashville	TN	530.014	\$51,379	92.3	\$55,665	29503347.03
New Orleans	LA	501.482	\$40,672	94.0	\$43,268	21698165.86
Ocala	FL	113.115	\$31,547	86.1	\$36,640	4144528.345
Odessa-Midland	TX	44.537	\$39,029	76.2	\$51,219	2281147.734
Oklahoma City	OK	443.228	\$40,347	84.3	\$47,861	21213428.37
Omaha	NE-IA	303.476	\$52,174	92.2	\$56,588	17173055.12
Orlando	FL	671.499	\$45,146	95.6	\$47,224	31710767.63
Panama City	FL	61.505	\$36,595	88.7	\$41,257	2537514.628
Pensacola	FL	160.360	\$36,969	88.0	\$42,010	6736760.045
Phoenix-Mesa	AZ	1292.754	\$49,779	98.7	\$50,435	65199596.12
Pine Bluff	AR	37.882	\$33,714	79.1	\$42,622	1614606.508
Pocatello	ID	29.893	\$39,862	85.1	\$46,841	1400228.867
Provo-Orem	UT	108.791	\$51,599	101.8	\$50,687	5514250.304
Punta Gorda	FL	67.620	\$32,633	95.2	\$34,278	2317902.794
Raleigh-Durham-Chapel Hill	NC	545.865	\$56,436	103.6	\$54,475	29735943.19
Rapid City	SD	44.792	\$40,540	90.0	\$45,044	2017630.756
Reno	NV	143.187	\$54,011	111.2	\$48,571	6954741.958
Richmond-Petersburg	VA	438.634	\$52,306	94.1	\$55,586	24381710.95
Roanoke	VA	120.573	\$45,151	84.7	\$53,307	6427380.783
Rocky Mount	NC	54.840	\$32,401	85.3	\$37,985	2083084.22
Salt Lake City-Ogden	UT	489.041	\$56,636	97.3	\$58,208	28465905.53
San Angelo	TX	40.179	\$36,982	77.3	\$47,842	1922250.683
San Antonio	TX	631.826	\$43,228	82.8	\$52,208	32986200.88
Sarasota-Bradenton	FL	277.392	\$42,449	100.0	\$42,449	11775013.01
Savannah	GA	114.289	\$41,802	91.0	\$45,936	5250009.646
Sherman-Denison	TX	44.410	\$39,443	81.6	\$48,337	2146646.605
Shreveport-Bossier City	LA	145.991	\$38,129	78.5	\$48,572	7091071.132
Sioux City	IA-NE	53.904	\$42,492	84.5	\$50,286	2710637.595
Sioux Falls	SD	75.817	\$52,728	92.6	\$56,942	4317147.706
Sumter	SC	38.310	\$34,456	82.4	\$41,816	1601953.107
Tallahassee	FL	129.332	\$41,207	99.5	\$41,414	5356164.547
Tampa-St. Petersburg-Clearwater	FL	1055.508	\$41,625	92.6	\$44,951	47446566.41

Texarkana	TX-AR	49.458	\$35,017	73.4	\$47,707	2359496.984
Topeka	KS	90.765	\$43,972	82.7	\$53,170	4826020.048
Tucson	AZ	349.085	\$40,683	98.0	\$41,513	14491658.22
Tulsa	OK	346.806	\$44,811	86.8	\$51,626	17904059.52
Tuscaloosa	AL	76.271	\$36,407	90.9	\$40,052	3054783.605
Tyler	TX	68.588	\$43,361	80.8	\$53,665	3680747.856
Victoria	TX	40.746	\$43,566	75.5	\$57,703	2351179.121
Waco	TX	80.891	\$39,295	78.3	\$50,185	4059529.815
Waterloo-Cedar Falls	IA	63.775	\$41,213	83.2	\$49,535	3159085.427
West Palm Beach-Boca Raton	FL	502.110	\$51,876	111.2	\$46,651	23423973.35
Wichita	KS	225.855	\$47,797	85.8	\$55,707	12581808.2
Wichita Falls	TX	55.977	\$36,732	76.9	\$47,766	2673793.451
Wilmington	NC	120.692	\$40,224	97.6	\$41,213	4974093.246
Yuma	AZ	65.143	\$31,911	88.5	\$36,058	2348902.003
sum		29401.365	\$5,543,543	11710.4	\$6,293,575	1486857994
average		221.063	\$41,681	88.0	\$47,320	\$50,571

Table 5. Weighted Adjusted Family Income in SMSAs in Forced-Unionism States

Metropolitan Area	State	Total Households	Household Income	Cost of Living Index	Adjusted Household Income	Weighted Adjusted Household Income
Akron	OH	278.467	\$46,466	93.8	\$49,537	13794507.06
Albany-Schenectady-Troy	NY	336.508	\$48,861	110.0	\$44,419	14947379.44
Albuquerque	NM	301.662	\$45,403	94.6	\$47,995	14478181.59
Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton	PA	294.768	\$48,157	99.2	\$48,545	14309619.53
Altoona	PA	51.245	\$37,387	81.4	\$45,930	2353681.591
Anchorage	AK	121.510	\$70,833	118.5	\$59,775	7263221.797
Ann Arbor	MI	130.819	\$62,119	110.3	\$56,318	7367493.618
Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenah	WI	140.825	\$52,817	89.1	\$59,278	8347872.082
Atlantic City-Cape May	NJ	98.228	\$45,694	103.1	\$44,320	4353472.582
Bakersfield	CA	219.756	\$36,457	95.0	\$38,376	8433309.992
Baltimore	MD	1000.715	\$55,897	106.9	\$52,289	52326441.87
Bangor	ME	59.005	\$36,147	94.4	\$38,291	2259378.957
Barnstable-Yarmouth	MA	98.285	\$50,114	141.7	\$35,366	3475973.529
Bellingham	WA	67.997	\$41,931	106.6	\$39,335	2674654.978
Billings	MT	57.535	\$41,554	90.3	\$46,018	2647629.446
Binghamton	NY	101.114	\$38,750	84.7	\$45,750	4625935.655
Bloomington	IN	69.802	\$39,395	94.9	\$41,512	2897628.862
Bloomington-Normal	IL	58.835	\$54,304	94.4	\$57,525	3384508.305
Boston	MA-NH	1711.538	\$63,784	162.9	\$39,155	67015800.98
Boulder-Longmont	CO	120.106	\$66,602	140.8	\$47,303	5681320.889
Bremerton	WA	88.720	\$47,689	108.1	\$44,116	3913939.019
Bridgeport	CT	330.699	\$79,096	136.8	\$57,819	19120590.72
Buffalo-Niagara Falls	NY	468.899	\$43,785	87.6	\$49,983	23436920.91
Burlington	VT	77.998	\$52,027	109.2	\$47,644	3716118.998
Canton-Massillon	OH	160.688	\$41,834	90.9	\$46,022	7395183.49
Champaign-Urbana	IL	84.781	\$40,856	92.1	\$44,360	3760925.663
Charleston	WV	128.684	\$38,723	84.9	\$45,610	5869293.913
Chicago	IL	2821.475	\$63,096	119.8	\$52,668	148600823.5
Chico-Paradise	CA	82.268	\$34,282	116.1	\$29,528	2429208.937
Cincinnati - Covington	OH-KY-IN	796.710	\$50,023	93.0	\$53,788	42853574.55
Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria	OH	858.157	\$46,630	99.6	\$46,817	40176567.18
Colorado Springs	CO	212.658	\$52,276	103.1	\$50,704	10782647.53
Columbia	MO	58.991	\$44,112	89.5	\$49,287	2907498.315
Columbus	OH	659.880	\$50,334	95.8	\$52,541	34670563.59
Corvallis	OR	30.697	\$48,602	109.0	\$44,589	1368748.251
Cumberland	MD-WV	40.147	\$31,176	79.0	\$39,463	1584332.749
Dayton-Springfield	OH	340.581	\$45,798	87.7	\$52,221	17785551.47
Decatur	IL	45.798	\$44,896	77.4	\$58,005	2656520.682
Denver	CO	886.588	\$62,986	118.9	\$52,974	46966048.59

Detroit	MI	766.728	\$55,418	101.5	\$54,599	41862593.4
Dover	DE	49.275	\$41,631	96.0	\$43,366	2136841.172
Eau Claire	WI	58.471	\$43,031	92.1	\$46,722	2731884.474
Elkhart-Goshen	IN	67.815	\$49,970	87.3	\$57,239	3881690.206
Elmira	NY	35.113	\$38,514	81.8	\$47,083	1653229.929
Erie	PA	106.889	\$40,948	85.9	\$47,669	5095332.68
Eugene-Springfield	OR	133.205	\$39,250	99.0	\$39,646	5281107.323
Evansville-Henderson	IN-KY	137.926	\$43,944	81.1	\$54,185	7473514.358
Flint	MI	173.039	\$48,069	88.5	\$54,315	9398657.278
Fort Collins-Loveland	CO	103.065	\$52,465	116.3	\$45,112	4649445.593
Fort Wayne	IN	154.456	\$48,099	83.6	\$57,535	8886577.923
Fresno	CA	265.219	\$35,635	103.6	\$34,397	9122663.19
Gary	IN	256.617	\$47,700	97.6	\$48,873	12541630.02
Glens Falls	NY	48.907	\$39,879	95.6	\$41,714	2040127.88
Grand Junction	CO	48.204	\$39,565	99.3	\$39,844	1920635.71
Grand Rapids-Muskegon-Holland	MI	469.386	\$53,279	93.5	\$56,983	26746969.73
Great Falls	MT	32.488	\$36,389	86.3	\$42,166	1369879.295
Greeley	CO	72.088	\$42,835	106.2	\$40,334	2907617.213
Green Bay	WI	112.110	\$52,905	93.7	\$56,462	6329967.503
Hagerstown	MD	89.472	\$42,490	91.5	\$46,437	4154825.443
Harrisburg-Lebanon-Carlisle	PA	253.206	\$48,289	91.1	\$53,007	13421585.66
Hartford	CT	456.141	\$59,970	113.1	\$53,024	24186362.31
Honolulu	HI	295.182	\$60,112	152.7	\$39,366	11620157.42
Huntington-Ashland	WV-KY-OH	117.489	\$29,981	81.2	\$36,922	4337977.474
Indianapolis	IN	617.527	\$52,554	87.3	\$60,199	37174700.98
Jackson	MI	59.367	\$44,494	89.7	\$49,603	2944788.515
Jamestown	NY	54.266	\$33,311	84.6	\$39,375	2136707.714
Janesville-Beloit	WI	59.709	\$46,791	91.5	\$51,138	3053381.223
Johnstown	PA	59.983	\$30,250	79.7	\$37,955	2276644.605
Joplin	MO	63.103	\$36,904	74.2	\$49,736	3138481.283
Kalamazoo-Battle Creek	MI	123.836	\$42,578	88.5	\$48,111	5957840.913
Kankakee	IL	38.756	\$43,233	93.7	\$46,140	1788194.395
Kenosha	WI	286.278	\$49,238	98.0	\$50,243	14383424.66
Kokomo	IN	41.517	\$47,020	83.2	\$56,514	2346309.303
La Crosse	WI-MN	50.026	\$42,400	91.7	\$46,238	2313088.768
Lafayette	IN	68.303	\$43,472	86.3	\$50,373	3440635.013
Lancaster	PA	176.855	\$50,626	94.6	\$53,516	9464546.755
Lansing-East Lansing	MI	176.025	\$48,810	90.2	\$54,113	9525255.266
Las Cruces	NM	61.449	\$30,819	84.9	\$36,300	2230620.413
Lewiston-Auburn	ME	42.744	\$36,956	95.2	\$38,819	1659293.345
Lexington	KY	168.192	\$44,066	92.1	\$47,846	8047284.117
Lima	OH	40.716	\$40,804	86.3	\$47,282	1925116.644
Los Angeles-Long Beach	CA	3244.118	\$50,203	139.3	\$36,039	116916335.9
Louisville	KY-IN	474.003	\$46,230	89.5	\$51,654	24483976.19
Madison	WI	211.508	\$54,655	105.3	\$51,904	10978128.91
Manchester	NH	149.658	\$59,976	115.5	\$51,927	7771331.782
Mansfield	OH	49.458	\$36,080	87.3	\$41,329	2044037.388
Medford-Ashland	OR	74.171	\$38,067	106.0	\$35,912	2663648.544
Merced	CA	68.741	\$31,368	111.7	\$28,082	1930409.748
Milwaukee-Waukesha	WI	596.306	\$53,304	106.8	\$49,910	29761699.46
Minneapolis-St. Paul	MN-WI	1176.002	\$65,330	114.7	\$56,957	66981875.03
Missoula	MT	39.697	\$40,912	104.1	\$39,301	1560118.793
Modesto	CA	157.398	\$43,640	116.7	\$37,395	5885902.931
Muncie	IN	47.330	\$37,248	80.5	\$46,271	2189997.317
New Haven-Meriden	CT	325.283	\$68,472	116.9	\$58,573	19052846.51
New York	NY	4276.413	\$52,380	161.0	\$32,534	139129511.1
Newark	NJ	767.856	\$68,961	140.5	\$49,083	37688339.94
Oakland	CA	898.931	\$71,689	179.3	\$39,983	35941697.97
Olympia	WA	86.397	\$46,826	104.5	\$44,810	3871412.366
Owensboro	KY	43.721	\$37,214	81.4	\$45,717	1998812.4
Parkersburg-Marietta	WV-OH	66.490	\$36,670	86.8	\$42,247	2808972.696
Peoria-Pekin	IL	144.193	\$46,992	83.9	\$56,010	8076182.903
Philadelphia	PA-NJ	2172.356	\$55,192	105.2	\$52,464	113970220.9
Pittsburgh	PA	996.654	\$41,809	90.0	\$46,454	46299007.87

Pittsfield	MA	55.801	\$41,865	108.6	\$38,550	2151113.135
Portland	ME	203.181	\$52,418	112.4	\$46,635	9475392.934
Portland-Vancouver	OR-WA	785.802	\$54,290	109.7	\$49,490	38888961.33
Providence-Fall River-Warwick	RI-MA	629.352	\$47,646	118.4	\$40,242	25326102.53
Pueblo	CO	56.961	\$34,723	87.7	\$39,593	2255252.911
Racine	WI	72.191	\$52,627	95.6	\$55,049	3974054.139
Reading	PA	145.550	\$47,777	93.8	\$50,935	7413584.595
Redding	CA	67.130	\$33,940	105.3	\$32,232	2163715.29
Riverside-San Bernardino	CA	1122.658	\$45,837	112.6	\$40,708	45700954.48
Rochester	MN-WI	65.211	\$62,051	102.7	\$60,420	3940027.031
Rochester	NY	401.703	\$49,179	90.5	\$54,341	21829118.05
Rockford	IL	126.127	\$48,069	91.4	\$52,592	6633259.04
Sacramento	CA	718.424	\$51,893	123.4	\$42,053	30211650.43
Saginaw-Bay City-Midland	MI	124.952	\$43,890	84.8	\$51,757	6467150.094
Salem	OR	129.616	\$45,688	100.4	\$45,506	5898302.598
Salinas	CA	125.410	\$59,292	169.5	\$34,981	4386908.389
San Diego	CA	1033.960	\$54,972	157.7	\$34,859	36042390.06
San Francisco	CA	681.491	\$76,164	196.4	\$38,780	26428248.74
San Jose	CA	585.464	\$93,503	184.1	\$50,789	29735274.52
San Luis Obispo-Atascadero-Paso Robles	CA	95.922	\$48,421	155.1	\$31,219	2994609.389
Santa Cruz-Watsonville	CA	91.077	\$69,148	177.6	\$38,935	3546054.277
Santa Fe	NM	55.130	\$52,824	118.6	\$44,540	2455469.747
Santa Rosa	CA	177.316	\$61,423	177.3	\$34,644	6142854.297
SantaBarbara-Santa Maria-Lompoc	CA	138.544	\$51,277	173.6	\$29,537	4092235.419
Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton	PA	226.230	\$34,708	86.4	\$40,171	9087952.361
Seattle-Bellevue-Everett	WA	962.403	\$69,730	123.0	\$56,691	54559643.24
Sheboygan	WI	43.801	\$50,326	91.0	\$55,303	2422339.699
South Bend	IN	122.001	\$43,880	82.4	\$53,252	6496849.369
Spokane	WA	168.501	\$42,105	89.4	\$47,097	7935944.748
Springfield	IL	84.973	\$45,936	81.6	\$56,294	4783480.059
Springfield	MA	264.242	\$43,948	104.5	\$42,056	11112830.06
Springfield	MO	150.433	\$40,086	83.1	\$48,238	7256627.242
St. Cloud	MN	63.020	\$43,220	98.2	\$44,012	2773650.102
St. Joseph	MO	46.704	\$37,598	81.3	\$46,246	2159873.299
St. Louis	MO-IL	1075.524	\$51,803	89.0	\$58,206	62601539.07
State College	PA	50.755	\$38,383	92.5	\$41,495	2106085.584
Stockton-Lodi	CA	199.217	\$44,975	122.8	\$36,625	7296241.511
Syracuse	NY	255.232	\$44,748	88.4	\$50,620	12919820.74
Tacoma	WA	274.842	\$52,137	105.5	\$49,419	13582405.07
Terre Haute	IN	65.763	\$36,209	82.9	\$43,678	2872391.396
Toledo	OH	261.918	\$43,082	91.0	\$47,343	12399946.46
Trenton	NJ	129.636	\$69,514	113.0	\$61,517	7974793.72
Utica-Rome	NY	116.517	\$36,763	89.4	\$41,122	4791403.211
Vallejo-Fairfield-Napa	CA	136.795	\$63,508	149.1	\$42,594	5826677.975
Vineland-Millville-Bridgeton	NJ	49.874	\$40,867	91.9	\$44,469	2217846.309
Visalia-Tulare-Porterville	CA	114.983	\$36,518	94.1	\$38,808	4462220.185
Wausau	WI	48.369	\$49,498	89.8	\$55,120	2666112.207
Wheeling	WV-OH	61.374	\$32,899	84.8	\$38,796	2381065.125
Williamsport	PA	46.923	\$35,909	82.9	\$43,316	2032518.706
Wilmington-Newark	DE-MD	252.269	\$61,464	102.4	\$60,023	15142052.55
Worcester	MA-CT	293.426	\$54,294	114.3	\$47,501	13938120.07
Yakima	WA	75.224	\$37,597	92.8	\$40,514	3047625.784
York	PA	152.095	\$47,924	91.3	\$52,491	7983571.501
Youngstown-Warren	OH	237.262	\$36,916	82.9	\$44,531	10565457.17
Yuba City-Marysville	CA	49.768	\$34,857	109.4	\$31,862	1585706.742
sum		49820.013	\$7,519,124	16376.5	\$7,348,029	2307330599
average		315.317	\$47,589	103.6	\$46,507	\$46,313

In the above two tables, the weighted adjusted family income is calculated for Right to Work states and forced-unionism states. Table 4 lists alphabetically the 133 SMSAs in the Right to Work states and their related data. Table 5 lists the 158 SMSAs in forced-

unionism states and their related data. For each SMSA, the following data are listed: number of households, adjusted household income, and weighted adjusted household income. In the final column, the sum of weighted adjusted household incomes is divided by total number of households to estimate weighted average adjusted household income in Right to Work states and in forced-unionism states.

The weighted average adjusted household income in SMSAs in Right to Work states is \$50,571; the weighted average adjusted household income in SMSAs in forced-unionism states is \$46,313. This differential, \$4258, reveals a much greater gap in the standard of living between Right to Work states and forced-unionism states when we take into account the number of households living in each SMSA. The weighted adjusted household income in SMSAs in Right to Work states is \$3251 above the unweighted average adjusted household income in these SMSAs. In contrast, the weighted average adjusted household income in SMSAs in force-unionism states is \$194 below the unweighted measure for these SMSAs. In the following section we discuss some indirect evidence that differences in migration may account for these differences in standards of living in Right to Work states and forced-unionism states.

Migration and Adjusted Household Income

A fundamental hypothesis in the literature on migration is that differences in the cost of living will motivate people to migrate. As Savageau and D'Agostino argued:

We... flee living costs that have gotten so high we can't afford them. Metro areas attract people because of expanding job opportunities, sure. But people also vote with their feet by heading for metro areas where cost of living factors like income taxes and house prices look like bargains.^v

Sperling and Sanders reach a similar conclusion in their more recent study.^{vi}

Our evidence shows that while average money incomes are higher in SMSAs in forced-unionism states than in SMSAs in Right to Work states, the cost of living is also higher. When we take into account the differences in cost of living, the adjusted household income is higher in SMSAs in Right to Work states than in forced-unionism states. Therefore, we expect workers to migrate into these SMSAs in Right to Work states.

We do not have direct evidence on migration into these SMSAs. However, we do have indirect evidence that suggests that workers have been attracted into SMSAs in Right to Work states, consistent with our hypothesis.

In the final set of tables, we have compiled evidence on the weighted adjusted income for households in metropolitan areas with above average (real) incomes. Table 6 compiles this evidence for SMSAs in the Right to Work states, while Table 7 shows the same data for SMSAs in forced-unionism states.

Table 6. Weighted Adjusted Household Income for Upper Income Households in SMSAs in Right to Work States

Metropolitan Area	State	Total Households	Household Income	Cost of Living Index	Adjusted Household Income	Weighted Adjusted Household Income
Fort Worth-Arlington	TX	666.601	\$55,157	85.9	\$64,211	42802923.58
Austin-San Marcos	TX	511.992	\$60,068	95.3	\$63,030	32271076.03
Dallas	TX	1343.418	\$59,153	95.0	\$62,266	83649689.43
Atlanta	GA	1662.995	\$59,423	96.6	\$61,514	102298293.9
Houston	TX	1760.874	\$55,692	91.8	\$60,667	106826356
Cedar Rapids	IA	96.446	\$54,695	91.6	\$59,711	5758858.046
Jackson	MS	184.628	\$46,856	79.1	\$59,236	10936699.83
Des Moines	IA	196.918	\$55,547	94.2	\$58,967	11611681.68
Salt Lake City-Ogden	UT	489.041	\$56,636	97.3	\$58,208	28465905.53
Victoria	TX	40.746	\$43,566	75.5	\$57,703	2351179.121
Sioux Falls	SD	75.817	\$52,728	92.6	\$56,942	4317147.706
Huntsville	AL	140.261	\$49,596	87.1	\$56,941	7986664.243
Omaha	NE-IA	303.476	\$52,174	92.2	\$56,588	17173055.12
Wichita	KS	225.855	\$47,797	85.8	\$55,707	12581808.2
Nashville	TN	530.014	\$51,379	92.3	\$55,665	29503347.03
Richmond-Petersburg	VA	438.634	\$52,306	94.1	\$55,586	24381710.95
Raleigh-Durham-Chapel Hill	NC	545.865	\$56,436	103.6	\$54,475	29735943.19
Little Rock-North Little Rock	AR	247.781	\$45,421	83.4	\$54,462	13494557.32
Columbia	SC	253.768	\$48,503	89.5	\$54,193	13752524.36
Charlotte-Gastonia-Rock Hill	NC-SC	544.612	\$51,559	95.7	\$53,876	29341327.18
Lincoln	NE	109.119	\$50,530	93.9	\$53,813	5871973.45
Tyler	TX	68.588	\$43,361	80.8	\$53,665	3680747.856
Roanoke	VA	120.573	\$45,151	84.7	\$53,307	6427380.783
Topeka	KS	90.765	\$43,972	82.7	\$53,170	4826020.048
Casper	WY	27.277	\$45,555	86.7	\$52,543	1433222.301
Jacksonville	NC	48.613	\$43,448	83.2	\$52,221	2538626.952
San Antonio	TX	631.826	\$43,228	82.8	\$52,208	32986200.88
Memphis	TN-AR-MS	461.195	\$46,253	89.2	\$51,853	23914408.45
Tulsa	OK	346.806	\$44,811	86.8	\$51,626	17904059.52
Jackson	TN	42.249	\$42,715	83.3	\$51,279	2166465.828
Odessa-Midland	TX	44.537	\$39,029	76.2	\$51,219	2281147.734
Jacksonville	FL	457.030	\$45,338	89.0	\$50,942	23281827.12
Amarillo	TX	87.558	\$40,876	80.3	\$50,904	4457062.027
Greensboro-Winston-Salem-High Point	NC	528.874	\$46,430	91.6	\$50,688	26807445.22
Provo-Orem	UT	108.791	\$51,599	101.8	\$50,687	5514250.304
Boise	ID	183.684	\$46,322	91.5	\$50,625	9299027.593
Phoenix-Mesa	AZ	1292.754	\$49,779	98.7	\$50,435	65199596.12
Sioux City	IA-NE	53.904	\$42,492	84.5	\$50,286	2710637.595
Dubuque	IA	34.032	\$44,603	88.8	\$50,229	1709379.838
Waco	TX	80.891	\$39,295	78.3	\$50,185	4059529.815
Abilene	TX	58.244	\$37,944	75.7	\$50,124	2919432.412
Lake Charles	LA	72.460	\$40,197	80.6	\$49,872	3613740.223
Iowa City	IA	54.122	\$48,432	97.7	\$49,572	2682944.426
Corpus Christi	TX	143.242	\$39,789	80.3	\$49,550	7097703.534
Waterloo-Cedar Falls	IA	63.775	\$41,213	83.2	\$49,535	3159085.427
Fayetteville-Springdale-Rogers	AR	140.829	\$40,370	82.0	\$49,232	6933252.11
Bismarck	ND	38.583	\$43,662	88.8	\$49,169	1897084.399
Cheyenne	WY	32.572	\$45,478	92.5	\$49,165	1601415.585
Fort Smith	AR-OK	107.306	\$37,488	76.4	\$49,068	5265297.55
Macon	GA	85.819	\$42,106	85.9	\$49,017	4206629.586
Decatur	AL	57.831	\$40,227	82.1	\$48,998	2833578.121
Charlottesville	VA	70.067	\$50,130	102.5	\$48,907	3426788.985
Montgomery	AL	132.254	\$41,426	84.8	\$48,851	6460795.052
Albany	GA	58.396	\$39,954	81.9	\$48,784	2848783.619

Hickory-Morganton-Lenoir	NC	137.750	\$41,734	85.9	\$48,584	6692501.164
Shreveport-Bossier City	LA	145.991	\$38,129	78.5	\$48,572	7091071.132
Reno	NV	143.187	\$54,011	111.2	\$48,571	6954741.958
Beaumont-Port Arthur	TX	142.020	\$38,803	80.0	\$48,504	6888502.575
Sherman-Denison	TX	44.410	\$39,443	81.6	\$48,337	2146646.605
Fayetteville	NC	120.844	\$42,175	87.4	\$48,255	5831345.195
Augusta-Aiken	GA-SC	188.689	\$40,794	84.7	\$48,163	9087814.718
Killeen-Temple	TX	115.609	\$38,754	80.5	\$48,142	5565603.958
Longview-Marshall	TX	98.439	\$36,536	76.0	\$48,074	4732325.4
Birmingham	AL	421.585	\$45,047	94.0	\$47,922	20203339.89
Oklahoma City	OK	443.228	\$40,347	84.3	\$47,861	21213428.37
Chattanooga	TN-GA	193.336	\$41,671	87.1	\$47,843	9249718.09
San Angelo	TX	40.179	\$36,982	77.3	\$47,842	1922250.683
Wichita Falls	TX	55.977	\$36,732	76.9	\$47,766	2673793.451
Texarkana	TX-AR	49.458	\$35,017	73.4	\$47,707	2359496.984
Greenville-Spartanburg-Anderson	SC	320.656	\$42,630	89.4	\$47,685	15290341.48
SUM		18855.666	\$3,186,700	6096.0	\$3,651,505	1039159211
AVERAGE		269.367	\$45,524	87.1	\$52,164	\$55,111

Table 7. Weighted Adjusted Household Income for Upper Income Households in SMSAs in Forced-Unionism States

Metropolitan Area	State	Total Households	Household Income	Cost of Living Index	Adjusted Household Income	Weighted Adjusted Household Income
Trenton	NJ	129.636	\$69,514	113.0	\$61,517	7974793.72
Rochester	MN-WI	65.211	\$62,051	102.7	\$60,420	3940027.031
Indianapolis	IN	617.527	\$52,554	87.3	\$60,199	37174700.98
Wilmington-Newark	DE-MD	252.269	\$61,464	102.4	\$60,023	15142052.55
Anchorage	AK	121.510	\$70,833	118.5	\$59,775	7263221.797
Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenah	WI	140.825	\$52,817	89.1	\$59,278	8347872.082
New Haven-Meriden	CT	325.283	\$68,472	116.9	\$58,573	19052846.51
St. Louis	MO-IL	1075.524	\$51,803	89.0	\$58,206	62601539.07
Decatur	IL	45.798	\$44,896	77.4	\$58,005	2656520.682
Bridgeport	CT	330.699	\$79,096	136.8	\$57,819	19120590.72
Fort Wayne	IN	154.456	\$48,099	83.6	\$57,535	8886577.923
Bloomington-Normal	IL	58.835	\$54,304	94.4	\$57,525	3384508.305
Elkhart-Goshen	IN	67.815	\$49,970	87.3	\$57,239	3881690.206
Grand Rapids-Muskegon-Holland	MI	469.386	\$53,279	93.5	\$56,983	26746969.73
Minneapolis-St. Paul	MN-WI	1176.002	\$65,330	114.7	\$56,957	66981875.03
Seattle-Bellevue-Everett	WA	962.403	\$69,730	123.0	\$56,691	54559643.24
Kokomo	IN	41.517	\$47,020	83.2	\$56,514	2346309.303
Green Bay	WI	112.110	\$52,905	93.7	\$56,462	6329967.503
Ann Arbor	MI	130.819	\$62,119	110.3	\$56,318	7367493.618
Springfield	IL	84.973	\$45,936	81.6	\$56,294	4783480.059
Peoria-Pekin	IL	144.193	\$46,992	83.9	\$56,010	8076182.903
Sheboygan	WI	43.801	\$50,326	91.0	\$55,303	2422339.699
Wausau	WI	48.369	\$49,498	89.8	\$55,120	2666112.207
Racine	WI	72.191	\$52,627	95.6	\$55,049	3974054.139
Detroit	MI	766.728	\$55,418	101.5	\$54,599	41862593.4
Rochester	NY	401.703	\$49,179	90.5	\$54,341	21829118.05
Flint	MI	173.039	\$48,069	88.5	\$54,315	9398657.278
Evansville-Henderson	IN-KY	137.926	\$43,944	81.1	\$54,185	7473514.358
Lansing-East Lansing	MI	176.025	\$48,810	90.2	\$54,113	9525255.266
Cincinnati - Covington	OH-KY-IN	796.710	\$50,023	93.0	\$53,788	42853574.55
Lancaster	PA	176.855	\$50,626	94.6	\$53,516	9464546.755
South Bend	IN	122.001	\$43,880	82.4	\$53,252	6496849.369
Hartford	CT	456.141	\$59,970	113.1	\$53,024	24186362.31
Harrisburg-Lebanon-Carlisle	PA	253.206	\$48,289	91.1	\$53,007	13421585.66
Denver	CO	886.588	\$62,986	118.9	\$52,974	46966048.59
Chicago	IL	2821.475	\$63,096	119.8	\$52,668	148600823.5

Rockford	IL	126.127	\$48,069	91.4	\$52,592	6633259.04
Columbus	OH	659.880	\$50,334	95.8	\$52,541	34670563.59
York	PA	152.095	\$47,924	91.3	\$52,491	7983571.501
Philadelphia	PA-NJ	2172.356	\$55,192	105.2	\$52,464	113970220.9
Baltimore	MD	1000.715	\$55,897	106.9	\$52,289	52326441.87
Dayton-Springfield	OH	340.581	\$45,798	87.7	\$52,221	17785551.47
Manchester	NH	149.658	\$59,976	115.5	\$51,927	7771331.782
Madison	WI	211.508	\$54,655	105.3	\$51,904	10978128.91
Saginaw-Bay City-Midland	MI	124.952	\$43,890	84.8	\$51,757	6467150.094
Louisville	KY-IN	474.003	\$46,230	89.5	\$51,654	24483976.19
Janesville-Beloit	WI	59.709	\$46,791	91.5	\$51,138	3053381.223
Reading	PA	145.550	\$47,777	93.8	\$50,935	7413584.595
San Jose	CA	585.464	\$93,503	184.1	\$50,789	29735274.52
Colorado Springs	CO	212.658	\$52,276	103.1	\$50,704	10782647.53
Syracuse	NY	255.232	\$44,748	88.4	\$50,620	12919820.74
Lafayette	IN	68.303	\$43,472	86.3	\$50,373	3440635.013
Kenosha	WI	286.278	\$49,238	98.0	\$50,243	14383424.66
Buffalo-Niagara Falls	NY	468.899	\$43,785	87.6	\$49,983	23436920.91
Milwaukee-Waukesha	WI	596.306	\$53,304	106.8	\$49,910	29761699.46
Joplin	MO	63.103	\$36,904	74.2	\$49,736	3138481.283
Jackson	MI	59.367	\$44,494	89.7	\$49,603	2944788.515
Akron	OH	278.467	\$46,466	93.8	\$49,537	13794507.06
Portland-Vancouver	OR-WA	785.802	\$54,290	109.7	\$49,490	38888961.33
Tacoma	WA	274.842	\$52,137	105.5	\$49,419	13582405.07
Columbia	MO	58.991	\$44,112	89.5	\$49,287	2907498.315
Newark	NJ	767.856	\$68,961	140.5	\$49,083	37688339.94
Gary	IN	256.617	\$47,700	97.6	\$48,873	12541630.02
Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton	PA	294.768	\$48,157	99.2	\$48,545	14309619.53
Springfield	MO	150.433	\$40,086	83.1	\$48,238	7256627.242
Kalamazoo-Battle Creek	MI	123.836	\$42,578	88.5	\$48,111	5957840.913
Albuquerque	NM	301.662	\$45,403	94.6	\$47,995	14478181.59
Lexington	KY	168.192	\$44,066	92.1	\$47,846	8047284.117
Erie	PA	106.889	\$40,948	85.9	\$47,669	5095332.68
Burlington	VT	77.998	\$52,027	109.2	\$47,644	3716118.998
Worcester	MA-CT	293.426	\$54,294	114.3	\$47,501	13938120.07
Toledo	OH	261.918	\$43,082	91.0	\$47,343	12399946.46
Boulder-Longmont	CO	120.106	\$66,602	140.8	\$47,303	5681320.889
Lima	OH	40.716	\$40,804	86.3	\$47,282	1925116.644
Spokane	WA	168.501	\$42,105	89.4	\$47,097	7935944.748
Elmira	NY	35.113	\$38,514	81.8	\$47,083	1653229.929
Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria	OH	858.157	\$46,630	99.6	\$46,817	40176567.18
Eau Claire	WI	58.471	\$43,031	92.1	\$46,722	2731884.474
Portland	ME	203.181	\$52,418	112.4	\$46,635	9475392.934
SUM		27738.235	\$4,104,593	7797.2	\$4,158,992	1466023022
AVERAGE		351.117	\$51,957	98.7	\$52,645	\$52,852

64 percent of households in the Right to Work states live in SMSAs with above average adjusted household incomes. The weighted average adjusted household income for this top group of families in SMSAs in Right to Work states is \$55,111. There is a differential of 9 percent in the weighted average adjusted household income for this top group of households and that for all households living in SMSAs in Right to Work states.

56 percent of households in forced-unionism states live in SMSAs with above average adjusted family incomes. The weighted average adjusted household income for this top group is \$52,852. There is a 14 percent differential in the weighted average adjusted household income for this top group of families compared to that for all households living in SMSAs in forced-unionism states.

We can make several inferences from this indirect evidence on migration. First, a larger share of families in Right to Work states have chosen to live in SMSAs with higher adjusted household income, compared to families in forced-unionism states. These families receive higher adjusted household incomes than their counterparts living in forced-unionism states. While these families receive higher adjusted household incomes in the Right to Work states, there is greater convergence between their incomes and those of the average family living in these states.

What this evidence suggests is not only that families living in Right to Work states receive higher adjusted household incomes, but also there is greater mobility of workers into SMSAs with higher adjusted household income. We expect that the higher adjusted household incomes in SMSAs in Right to Work states would attract more workers. We also expect that migration of workers into these SMSAs would tend to bring convergence between the adjusted household incomes earned in these SMSAs relative to that for all SMSAs in the Right to Work states.

In contrast, the evidence suggests that families living in forced-unionism states not only receive lower adjusted household incomes, but also, there is less evidence of mobility of workers into SMSAs with higher adjusted household incomes. Even though there is a greater differential between the average adjusted household income for the top group of SMSAs and that for all SMSAs, a smaller share of workers have chosen to live in the higher income SMSAs. The relative gap between the average adjusted household income in these top SMSAs and that for all SMSAs is much greater in the forced-unionism states. This suggests less mobility of workers into the higher income SMSAs, and correspondingly less convergence in adjusted household income between the top SMSAs and all SMSAs in the forced-unionism states.

Our analysis is consistent with the hypothesis that workers are motivated to migrate to SMSAs not just by money income, but also by the cost of living and real adjusted household income. Other factors may also influence the mobility of workers. One factor that reduces the mobility of workers is union restrictions on entry. Such restrictions reduce the probability that a worker can obtain a job by migrating to an SMSA with a higher adjusted household income. Even for workers who do land a job, union restrictions are likely to increase the time of the job search and the costs of migration. We expect these restrictions to be greater in the absence of Right to Work laws. This is consistent with the evidence for a lack of convergence between the average adjusted household income among the top group of SMSAs and that for all SMSAs in the forced-unionism states.

One cost that is not captured in our cost of living data is the cost of union dues, fees, and other assessments. Including these in the cost of living index would reduce the adjusted household income for those families who must pay these costs. Given the higher percentage of workers who incur these union costs in forced-unionism states, we would expect a greater reduction in adjusted household income in these states, compared to Right to Work states. This would also help to explain the lack of mobility of families in forced-unionism states.

Another cost that is not captured in our cost of living data is federal income taxes. Federal income taxes are levied on money incomes. This means that families living in SMSAs in forced-unionism states would pay more in federal income taxes, because their money incomes are higher on average than that for families living in SMSAs in Right to Work states. If we included federal income taxes in our cost of living index, we would find an even greater differential between the adjusted family incomes received in SMSAs in Right to Work states compared to that in forced-unionism states.

A final cost, which is impossible to measure let alone incorporate into a cost of living index, is what Amartya Sen refers to as “negative freedom.”^{vii} Positive freedom refers to the tangible aspects of individual well being. When families receive a higher adjusted household income, this enables them to purchase more goods and services to enhance their well being. But man does not live by bread alone. An important determinant of individual well being is the absence of coercion, or negative freedom. We value the freedom to make choices regarding how we spend our income, where we choose to work and live, etc. Union restrictions on entry reduce the range of choices open to us regarding where we choose to live and work. These restrictions not only distort labor markets; they restrict the range of choices open to employees and employers to enter into labor contracts. Mandatory union dues not only reduce the disposable income available to workers, they also infringe on the freedom of contract for dissenting workers. We cannot measure these intangible dimensions of negative freedom, but we should not discount the role they play in influencing the choices that individuals make, and their perceptions of well being. We expect a more ubiquitous exercise of coercion over a wider range of choices, with a corresponding diminution in individual well being, in forced-unionism states compared to Right to Work states.

ⁱ “World Report: Is Mississippi Richer than New York?” First Chicago Bank, Chicago, Il. , 1977; and James T. Bennett, “Does a Higher Wage Really Mean that You Are Better Off?” National Institute of Labor Relations Research, Springfield, VA, 1985.

ⁱⁱ James T. Bennett, “Right to Work—Prescription for Prosperity and Opportunity,” National Institute for Labor Relations Research, Springfield, VA, 2000.

ⁱⁱⁱ David Savageau and Ralph D’Agostino, *Places Rated Almanac*, IDG Books, Foster City, CA, 2000.

^{iv} Bert Sperling and Peter Sander, *Cities Ranked and Rated*, Wiley Publishing, Inc. Hoboken, N.J., 2004.

^v Savageau and D’Agostino, *Places Rated Almanac*, p. 42.

^{vi} Sperling and Sander, p. xi.

^{vii} Amartya Sen, *Commodities and Capabilities*, North Holland, Amsterdam, 1985.

Barry W. Poulson, Ph.D., is an economist specializing in development economics and economic history. Dr. Poulson is an economics professor and former department chairman at the University of Colorado (UC) in Boulder. Also at UC, he serves as director of the Colorado Council on Economic Education's Center for Economic Education.

Dr. Poulson is a past president of the North American Economics and Finance Association. He is currently an adjunct scholar of the Heritage Foundation and senior fellow of the Independence Institute. He also serves on the Colorado Commission on Taxation.

His special interests are constitutional economics, economic history, and economic development of the U.S. and developing nations. He is the author of a widely used college textbook, *Economic History of the U.S.*, and, more recently, *Economic Development: Private and Public Choice*.

He received his B.A. from Ohio Wesleyan University, his M.A. and his Ph.D. (1965) from Ohio State University. Dr. Poulson was a Fulbright professor at Autonomous University, Guadalajara in 1976 and visiting professor, Carlos III University, Madrid in 1995.

* * *

The National Institute for Labor Relations Research is an organization whose primary function is to act as a research facility for the general public, scholars and students. It provides the supplementary analysis and research necessary to expose the inequities of compulsory unionism.

The Institute is classified by the Internal Revenue Service as a Section 501(c)(3) educational and research organization. Contributions and grants are tax deductible under Section 170 of the Code and are welcome from individuals, foundations, and corporations. The Institute will, upon request, provide documentation to substantiate tax-deductibility of a contribution or grant.

* * *

Nothing here is to be construed as an attempt to aid or hinder the passage of any bill before Congress.